

1. Call to Order - THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY CHAIRMAN LARRY FOX AT 7:00 PM

2. Pledge of Allegiance

3. Roll Call

PRESENT: Joe Colaianne, Thomas Murphy, Larry Fox, Sue Grissim, Michael Mitchell, Keith Voight

ABSENT: Jeff Newsom

4. Approval of Meeting Agenda

Motion to Approve Meeting Agenda

A Motion to approve the Meeting Agenda was made by Commissioner Grissim and seconded by Commissioner Colaianne. Motion carried unanimously.

| | |
|------------------|---|
| RESULT: | APPROVED [UNANIMOUS] |
| MOVER: | Sue Grissim, Commissioner |
| SECONDER: | Joe Colaianne, Trustee |
| AYES: | Colaianne, Murphy, Fox, Grissim, Mitchell, Voight |
| ABSENT: | Newsom |

5. Approval of Meeting Minutes

a. Planning Commission - Regular Meeting - Feb 28, 2019 7:00 PM

A Motion to approve the Meeting Minutes of February 28, 2019 was made by Commissioner Mitchell and seconded by Commissioner Voight. Motion carried unanimously.

| | |
|------------------|---|
| RESULT: | ACCEPTED [UNANIMOUS] |
| MOVER: | Michael Mitchell, Commissioner |
| SECONDER: | Keith Voight, Secretary |
| AYES: | Colaianne, Murphy, Fox, Grissim, Mitchell, Voight |
| ABSENT: | Newsom |

6. Call to Public

Chris Turner, Hartland Township; Mr. Turner shared concerns about traffic and speed control on East Street before and after school.

7. Old and New Business

a. Retail Market Analysis

Director Langer explained the impetus for the Retail Market Analysis.

- Planning Commission is reviewing the quantity and location of commercial zoned property.
- Retail is changing moving away from big box sellers.
- Township was approached by a developer that wanted to use a commercial zoned property for their residential project stating that the area could not support the amount of commercially zoned property Hartland has available.
- Planning Commission and Township Board desired to have more information before making any adjustments.
- Gibbs Planning Group was selected to perform a Retail Market Analysis.
- One of many steps the Township will utilize as it plans for the future.

- This information will be used to update the Future Land Use Map and Comprehensive Plan.
- Planning Commission will have work to do after this to meet the demands of commercial and make any changes needed to ensure Hartland is successful in the future.

Robert Gibbs, Gibbs Planning Group presented the Retail Market Analysis stating the following:

- Useful for business owners looking for information about expanding their business and who their customers are.
- Useful for landlords and real estate developers to help determine what use might be best suited for a particular property.
- Large amount of their business is working with the private sector, real estate developers, banks, financial institutions and universities to help them realize the market potentials for various locations.
- Good policy tool for the community to help determine long range zoning and to get a sense for what the market will do in the next fifteen or twenty years.

Mr. Gibbs presented the Retail Market Analysis

- Approximately sixty percent (60%) of the retail dollars spent are being spent outside of Hartland, including ten percent (10 %) online shopping.
- Believe they can capture approximately \$35 million of additional retail sales.
- Demographics show the primary and secondary population areas have a solid population with an above-average household income to support retail in Hartland.
- Surprised to find out people in other communities drive to Hartland because they prefer the Hartland store(s) even though they may drive past one in their community to shop.
- Emagine Theatre has already impacted the area in a positive way and will continue to draw more retail, restaurants and supporting businesses.
- Found an usually high demand (117,000 square feet) for Retail-Restaurant in this market at this time on 15 acres of land.
- By 2035, it is anticipated the need for commercial land will be approximately 35 acres and 160,000 square feet of retail.
- Found higher than the national average of dollars spent per square foot of retail sales: average is \$220 per square foot; Hartland is \$300 per square foot across the board in every category.
- It is anticipated that twenty-five percent (25%) of shopping malls will close by 2022. Retail trends are changing. Strip malls with large parking areas are on the decline. Walkable mixed shopping areas are desirable. Millennials are more inclined to spend their resources on experiences rather than hard goods in a brick and motor building.
- Cautioned the Planning Commission about rezoning commercially zoned land. Some communities keep two to three times the acreage reserved for future commercial development.
- Mixed Use developments are popular with commercial on the lower level and multi-family residential units above.

Chair Fox asked if the additional 117,000 square feet of retail in the report includes the already approved retail developments such as the RAMCO project that has 200,000 square feet approved for that site.

Mr. Gibbs stated it is in addition to what is already approved.

Commissioner Voight asked if the population numbers used were based on historical data.

Mr. Gibbs stated they used US Census data and two other data sources to estimate the projected population and job growth.

Director Langer asked how much the focus groups added to the data collection and the value of the focus groups.

Mr. Gibbs replied the focus groups were really helpful. He was surprised at the number of people that come to Hartland from other communities. They added to the amount of retail the area could capture.

Director Langer asked if there was something specific the focus groups mentioned that appealed to them, something we could grab on to and make sure we continue to do.

Mr. Gibbs replied yes. They stated they felt comfortable and safe shopping here. Also the buildings were more beautiful, the landscaping nicer, the buildings look prettier, they felt like there was a higher standard here. Even though it may be the same brand of store, they preferred the Hartland location and felt it was a better store. Even though they all sell the same product, they felt like they were getting a higher quality product and better service here. He thinks that is because Hartland does have higher building standards with nice materials and signage. He would encourage continuing with the standards that have been used.

Commissioner Voight mentioned he has a hard time visualizing 160,000 square feet but Silver Point is a 160,000, so if you look at how it is spread down the road in Fenton, as Mr. Gibbs said, we may need more than 25 acres available because the way a developer might want to build could be different.

Chair Fox stated Meijer is about 190,000 and Rural King is about the same. That is what you are equating it to if you chopped it up.

Commissioner Voight stated we may not want one big 160,000 square foot building; the other option would be if it were spread out across 25 to 35 acres.

Chair Fox asked about residential growth data. Is the source of the data looking at current projects in the pipeline or other sources?

Mr. Gibbs stated he does not put a lot of weight into the data we buy so we add to it. The population growth is based on the US Census data and two other databases based on job growth. We had to use the number as it was the only number we had but we thought it was very, very conservative. For example, we met a lot of empty nesters moving here from Ann Arbor, Royal Oak, Birmingham; people are moving here because they can get a nice home and a nice community. That does not show up under the growth. We publish the numbers but built our model assuming those are very conservative. It is not just Hartland; it is Fenton, Grand Blanc, Howell and Brighton. We weighed those numbers very conservatively.

Chair Fox stated we have a constant battle as do other communities with expectations; people saying the commercial should be built out by now, what is taking so long. It's been ten years since that development has been approved. So much seems to be driven by "rooftops". We hear that if you want development you have to get the people here.

Mr. Gibbs stated the site selection criteria used today is much stricter than it was before the recession. Even though there is a demand for retail, it may not happen because the retailers are dialing up their criteria. There are areas where there is very high demand but no one will go to because the stores have tripled their demand for rooftops they want. That could happen here too. It's going that direction quickly.

Chair Fox stated he believes that is why you see the power retail centers like Novi still exploding with growth. They are gobbling up the smaller markets that are the 15 or 20 minutes drive. We may have all of the components but we still have to convince the retailer to come when there are other stores within a 20 or 30 drive in either direction.

Mr. Gibbs stated it was common for retailers to open one store per day before the recession. Now they have cut back to one per month. Our job is to tell you what the market demand is but it is totally plausible with the severe changes in the industry that retailers may not come. Or it's possible someone will come along with a new concept, they like where the two highways cross, and see the potential. The studies we do today are much more conservative than they were 10 years ago.

An unidentified member of the public asked are there any areas that were close to being saturated.

Mr. Gibbs replied just groceries which is highly unusual. There are some very good grocery stores here now in the market.

Communications Director Jean McLeod asked how influential this study is as a tool for attracting new development.

Mr. Gibbs stated it can be influential. Other studies, when they become public, can induce a lot of interest. It's plausible. Some communities, after having a study, change their zoning to remove all commercial zoning because they do not want the growth and others say they want more. It is a very real, serious tool you have engaged us to do.

Commissioner Colaianni asked in reality how successful have some of the projections been in other communities.

Mr. Gibbs stated their projections are usually very close.

- New Dowagiac Bakery opened and sales were within one-percent of what was projected.
- Whole database where communities report back the sales.

Commissioner Colaianni stated he was looking at the specific commercial enterprises, so that is what you are referring to.

Mr. Gibbs stated yes, they looked at 52 different categories. He does not want to oversell his study. It is based on what the market demand is and we are assuming you could capture between four and nine percent of the leakage. It is always possible someone could build a beautiful store and not be very good at retail or someone could over perform. We do not have a crystal ball; it is based on what the market will bear. It is a great location with great demographics. Hartland is double the national sales and income, very strong demographics, and really high standards. One criterion some retailers have now is they only want to go to communities that have high standards. They will not go to communities where the Planning Commission is too lenient because they are going to put a lot of money into their store and they want the other stores around them to be of high quality.

Chair Fox stated the Planning Commission looked at and interviewed several companies for the Retail Market Analysis. Speaking to the quality of Gibbs Planning Group, any of the others would have been sufficient but we selected them for particular reasons and hope we can use this to further our goals in the Township. There is a lot of credibility behind it. Any of the organizations carry weight reporting anything that has their name on it.

Mr. Gibbs stated all of the demand could be absorbed with existing businesses by increasing their sales or expanding their product lines or hours.

Chair Fox stated this is something we can share with the Chamber. He supports shopping locally and if we can offer the people more and campaign that, he thinks they can all be successful.

Commissioner Colaianni stated it should be shared with the schools too. With the opportunity and demand; this is all about bringing enterprise here, we want those home-grown businesses too. That young person who has an idea that wants to start an enterprise, maybe they never thought of starting that in Hartland. There is a joint meeting coming up and this is something we could share with them.

An unidentified member of the public asked with so much room for additional retail, nearly three-quarters of a million square feet, what is keeping investors from coming to Hartland? Is it standards versus our strategy? At M59 and US 23 if the visibility of the businesses is far off the road rather than up to the road, are they not creating enough excitement that we can encourage these businesses to invest here? Recently, Wilson Marine opened a huge facility in Wixom and said he would not come here because of our restrictive ordinances and not allowing for outside storage. He also stated the procedure here to get approved is very long whereas Wixom is approving businesses in 30 days or less. Could we up our game a little bit and maybe get some more businesses? Is there something we can change to make this area more attractive so that we can build a 717,000 deficit?

Mr. Gibbs stated they can certainly talk after the meeting but his experience is Hartland's high standards and beautiful location is more desirable with retailers today. They are competing with the internet. Shoppers today are looking for an experiential activity not just a commodity; they are looking for a nice experience.

Commissioner Voight stated he thought it was a very thorough and professional report. He appreciated the focus groups being included. Some of the other companies did not include this in their process. They are helpful not only for the report but the information put in the report.

Mr. Gibbs stated he would be around after the meeting to answer questions.

| |
|-------------------------------------|
| RESULT: INFORMATIONAL |
|-------------------------------------|

8. Call to Public

Frank Crouse, Ore Valley Drive, Hartland Township;

- Shopping centers listed in the report were the Kroger center and the former Wal-Mart site.
- Asked why RAMCO pr Fountain Square were not listed as shopping centers.
- The report stated it is important to have very good visibility and signage and those are two debatable areas in Hartland Township as to if anyone has very good visibility or signage.
- Why does RAMCO after trying for 10 years have a 500,000 square foot shortfall?

Doug Coon.

- Stated Hartland has been the hole in the donut for 45 years.
- Mixed Use approach is 400 years old as practiced in Williamsburg, Virginia. Today this approach is considered modern.
- He would recommend doing more of that.
- World is changing drastically.
- Go forward carefully.
- Look at industrial development as that is an area that brings high paying jobs.

Julia Upfal, Ann Arbor SPARK, local economic service provider for Livingston County, offered assistance in connecting the Retail Market Analysis with local brokers and the commercial/real estate market. Retail is not typically their focus, typically it is industrial, but they view this as the third leg in the stool: retail, industrial/manufacturing, health care. They want to support it any way they can. If there is anything they can do to provide assistance in making sure the study gets into the right hands, they are happy to do so.

9. Planner's Report

Director Langer stated he had forwarded information regarding some new legislation that has passed regarding the new 5G small cell wireless antenna limiting local control. Michigan Municipal League forwarded a draft ordinance which has been sent to you. He is curious if that topic is something the Planning Commission is interested in looking at.

Director Langer offered a brief explanation of 5G.

The general consensus of the Planning Commission is they would like to take a look at it.

10. Committee Reports

None

11. Adjournment

Motion to Adjourn

A Motion to adjourn was made by Commissioner Colaianne and seconded by Commissioner Murphy. Motion carried unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 8:14 PM.

| | |
|------------------|---|
| RESULT: | APPROVED [UNANIMOUS] |
| MOVER: | Joe Colaianne, Trustee |
| SECONDER: | Thomas Murphy, Commissioner |
| AYES: | Colaianne, Murphy, Fox, Grissim, Mitchell, Voight |
| ABSENT: | Newsom |

Submitted by,



Keith Voight
Planning Commission Secretary